

August 8, 2018
Emanuel M. Carlebach
111 Rudwin Street
Lakewood, New Jersey 08701

Hon. Jesse Furman
Thurgood Marshall Courthouse
40 Foley Square
New York New York 10007

Dear Judge Furman,

I am the youngest brother of P. David Carlebach. I am writing to say how much he has meant to us over the past many years, and to portray something of his role in our family. During the years we grew up, David was the favorite among my older brothers. Our parents often didn't have the time or the energy to attend to us youngest ones. David took it upon himself to entertain us and keep us happy: he would put on entire shows for us, teach us how to play basketball like pros, and do our homework with us. He was so kind and talented! And his singing was always beautiful.

During his school years, David was the apple of all his teachers' eyes, and was destined for success. In any synagogue or other venue that he entered he immediately became the focal point of the crowd through his music and wisdom. After many years of religious study, David put himself through law school. When he

became a lawyer he was always extremely generous with his skills, time, and services. He very often did legal work for all types of people and never hinted at any charge. I know this from people who mentioned this to me even in recent times. He did this with largeness of spirit even though he could not really afford it. He has had a difficult family life and needed all the resources he could get to support them.

In the past ten years, I have been suffering from an advanced and early-onset case of Parkinson's Disease. It is extremely debilitating. Although David lives more than a two hour drive away, he made it his business to visit me whenever he could, to do errands for me, to help me with shopping, medical appointments and even the tasks of daily living that have become more difficult for me each day. He did the same for our elderly parents. Every day that he is away means he cannot perform these vital acts of kindness.

David committed a terrible error that has shocked us all. We know that he has pleaded guilty. He has never done anything like this before. I believe that his trusting nature may have led him into troubles that he could not surmount. He and his family have already paid a terrible price for this—he was held for many months in Rikers Island with hardened criminals. My father, an elderly, blind, Holocaust survivor wept for him every day. It was heartbreaking to behold. I do not know if he were to survive another period of incarceration of his child.

David still has a lot of positive things to offer to the world. It would be a terrible loss and a waste to the community for a mind of his caliber to waste away in jail. What an asset he could be if he were allowed to serve the community in whatever fashion you deem acceptable.

Please take into account all mitigating factors and don't sentence my brother harshly, as there is nothing to gain and everything to be lost the more time he is away.

Thank you for taking the time to read my letter. I hope you will act upon it and treat him with the kindness that he has so often extended to others.

Sincerely yours,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Emanuel Carlebach". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Emanuel M. Carlebach